

## STC Alternative and Workgroup Vote

### CM089 & CM091: Implementation of the Electricity System Restoration Standard & Implementation of Emergency and Restoration Code Phase II

**Please note:** To participate in any votes, Workgroup members need to have attended at least 50% of meetings.

#### Stage 1 - Alternative Vote

If Workgroup Alternative Requests have been made, vote on whether they should become Alternative STC Modifications.

#### Stage 2 - Workgroup Vote

2a) Assess the Original solution and Alternative STC Modifications (if there are any) against the STC objectives compared to the baseline (the current STC).

2b) If Alternative STC Modifications exist, vote on whether each Alternative STC Modification better facilitates the Applicable STC Objectives better than the Original Modification Proposal.

2c) Vote on which of the options is best.

#### Terms used in this document

Term	Meaning
Baseline	The current STC (if voting for the Baseline, you believe no modification should be made)
Original	The solution which was firstly proposed by the Proposer of the modification
Alternative STC Modification	An Alternative Solution which has been developed by the Workgroup

#### The Applicable STC Objectives are:

- (a) efficient discharge of the obligations imposed upon transmission licensees by transmission licences and the Act
- (b) development, maintenance and operation of an efficient, economical and coordinated system of electricity transmission
- (c) facilitating effective competition in the generation and supply of electricity, and (so far as consistent therewith) facilitating such competition in the distribution of electricity
- (d) protection of the security and quality of supply and safe operation of the national electricity transmission system insofar as it relates to interactions between transmission licensees

(e) promotion of good industry practice and efficiency in the implementation and administration of the arrangements described in the STC.

(f) facilitation of access to the national electricity transmission system for generation not yet connected to the national electricity transmission system or distribution system;

(g) compliance with the Electricity Regulation and any relevant legally binding decision of the European Commission and/or the Agency.

## Workgroup Vote

### Stage 1 – Alternative Vote

Vote on Workgroup Alternative Requests to become Alternative STC Modifications.

*The Alternative vote is carried out to identify the level of Workgroup support there is for any potential alternative options that have been brought forward by either any member of the Workgroup OR an Industry Participant as part of the Workgroup Consultation.*

*Should the majority of the Workgroup OR the Chair believe that the potential alternative solution would better facilitate the STC objectives (against Baseline or the Proposer's modification) then the potential alternative will be fully developed by the Workgroup with legal text to form Alternative STC Modifications and submitted to the Panel and Authority alongside the Proposer's Modification for the Panel Recommendation vote and the Authority decision.*

“Y” = Yes

“N” = No

“-“ = Neutral (Stage 2 only)

“Abstain”

Workgroup Member	Alternative 1 (Company, characteristic)	Alternative 2 (Company, characteristic)	Alternative 3 (Company, characteristic)	Alternative 4 (Company, characteristic)
Sade Adenola	NA	NA	NA	NA
Lewis Morgan	NA	NA	NA	NA
Mark Holland	NA	NA	NA	NA
Joel Matthews	NA	NA	NA	NA
Graeme Vincent	NA	NA	NA	NA
Alternative STC Modifications?				

## Stage 2a – Assessment against objectives

To assess the Original against the STC objectives compared to the baseline (the current STC).

You will also be asked to provide a statement to be added to the Workgroup Report alongside your vote to assist the reader in understanding the rationale for your vote.

ASO = Applicable STC Objective

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Overall (Y/N)
	Sade Adenola – National Grid ESO							
Original	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Voting Statement: The modifications will enhance the STC by making it align with the various ESRs changes to other industry codes such as the Grid Code and SQSS. The modifications specify clearly what the TOs must do to be ESRs compliant as well as clarifying how OFTOs are impacted by the ESRs requirement.								

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Overall (Y/N)
	Lewis Morgan – National Grid Electricity Transmission							
Original	Yes	Neutral	Yes	Yes	Neutral	Neutral	Yes	Yes
Voting Statement: The proposal aims to deliver the objectives of the ESRs which fundamentally improves security of supply. The change impacts on system access and outage planning which inherently makes coordination and maintenance of the transmission system more complex but I agree that this is required to satisfy the ESRs.  I believe that Objective C is delivered primarily through accompanying Grid Code modifications, although the STC changes proposed support the transmission system to facilitate this.  I do not believe that Objectives F is improved by this modification. The additional ESR requirements introduced through this modification and the SQSS changes may in some instances prohibit this, when considering customer connections.								

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Overall (Y/N)
	Mark Holland – Scottish Hydro Electric Transmission Ltd							
Original	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Voting Statement: No further comment								

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Overall (Y/N)
	Joel Matthews – Diamond Transmission Corp							
Original	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<p>Voting Statement:</p> <p>This modification ensures ESO can satisfy their Licence Obligation and aligns the STC with the Grid Code modifications required to facilitate the implementation of the EU Emergency and Restoration code.</p>								

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Overall (Y/N)
	Graeme Vincent – SP Energy Networks							
Original	Yes	No	Neutral	Yes	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral	Yes
<p>Voting Statement:</p> <p>Whilst appreciating the overall objectives of the modification, I believe that the application of requirements to onshore Transmission Licensees has not been undertaken in the most economic and efficient manner. A fuller understanding of how the ESO intends to meet its obligations to restore supplies under the ESRS would allow a more targeted and prioritised approach to future investment requirements to enable all parties to contribute to meeting the ESRS requirements by the 2026 deadline.</p> <p>Overall, the proposed modifications facilitate the implementation of the ESRS requirements into the STC and the ability of Transmission Licensees to assist the ESO in meeting its ESRS targets.</p>								

Of the 5 votes, how many voters said this option was better than the Baseline.

Option	Number of voters that voted this option as better than the Baseline
Original	5

### Stage 2b – Alternative STC Modification Vote (If required)

Where one or more Alternative STC Modifications exist, does each Alternative STC Modification better facilitate the Applicable STC Objectives than the Original Modification Proposal?

No required

### Stage 2c – Workgroup Vote

Which option is the best? (Baseline, Original Proposal)

Workgroup Member	Company	BEST Option?	Which objective(s) does the change better facilitate? (if baseline not applicable)
Sade Adenola	National Grid ESO	Original	a,b,c,d,e,f,g
Lewis Morgan	NGET	Original	a,c,d
Mark Holland	Scottish Hydro Electric Transmission Ltd	Original	a,b,c,d,e,f,g
Joel Matthews	Diamond Transmission Corp	Original	a,b,c,d,e,f,g
Graeme Vincent	SP Energy Networks	Original	a,d