

## Workgroup Vote – Stage 2

### CMP317 and CMP327: Workgroup Vote

**Please note:** To participate in any votes, Workgroup members need to have attended at least 50% of meetings.

#### Stage 2 - Workgroup Vote

2a) Assess the original and WACMs (if there are any) against the CUSC objectives compared to the baseline (the current CUSC).

2b) If WACMs exist, vote on whether each WACM better facilitates the Applicable CUSC Objectives better than the Original Modification Proposal.

2c) Vote on which of the options is best.

#### The Applicable CUSC Objectives (Charging) are:

- a. That compliance with the use of system charging methodology facilitates effective competition in the generation and supply of electricity and (so far as is consistent therewith) facilitates competition in the sale, distribution and purchase of electricity;
- b. That compliance with the use of system charging methodology results in charges which reflect, as far as is reasonably practicable, the costs (excluding any payments between transmission licensees which are made under and accordance with the STC) incurred by transmission licensees in their transmission businesses and which are compatible with standard licence condition C26 requirements of a connect and manage connection);
- c. That, so far as is consistent with sub-paragraphs (a) and (b), the use of system charging methodology, as far as is reasonably practicable, properly takes account of the developments in transmission licensees' transmission businesses;
- d. Compliance with the Electricity Regulation and any relevant legally binding decision of the European Commission and/or the Agency. These are defined within the National Grid Electricity Transmission plc Licence under Standard Condition C10, paragraph 1 \*; and
- e. Promoting efficiency in the implementation and administration of the CUSC arrangements.

\*Objective (d) refers specifically to European Regulation 2009/714/EC. Reference to the Agency is to the Agency for the Cooperation of Energy Regulators (ACER).

## Workgroup Vote

### Stage 2a – Assessment against objectives

To assess the original and WACMs against the CUSC objectives compared to the baseline (the current CUSC).

You will also be asked to provide a statement to be added to the Workgroup Report alongside your vote to assist the reader in understanding the rationale for your vote.

Y = Yes, N = No, (-) = Neutral

ACO = Applicable CUSC Objective

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ACO (a)	Better facilitates ACO (b)	Better facilitates ACO (c)	Better facilitates ACO (d)	Better facilitates ACO (e)	Overall (Y/N)
Paul Youngman Drax						
Original	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 1	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 2	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 3	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 4	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 5	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 6	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 7	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 8	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 9	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 10	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 11	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 12	<b>Positive</b>	-	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 13	<b>Positive</b>	-	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 14	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 15	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 16	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 17	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 18	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 19	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 20	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 21	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 22	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 23	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 24	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 25	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 26	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 27	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>

WACM 28	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 29	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 30	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 31	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 32	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 33	<b>Positive</b>	-	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 34	<b>Positive</b>	-	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 35	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 36	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 37	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 38	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 39	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 40	<b>Negative</b>	-	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 41	<b>Negative</b>	-	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 42	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 43	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 44	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 45	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 46	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 47	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 48	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 49	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 50	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 51	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 52	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 53	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 54	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 55	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 56	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 57	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 58	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 59	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 60	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 61	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 62	<b>Negative</b>	-	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 63	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 64	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 65	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 66	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 67	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 68	<b>Negative</b>	-	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 69	<b>Negative</b>	-	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 70	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 71	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 72	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 73	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 74	<b>Positive</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>

WACM 75	<b>Positive</b>	-	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 76	<b>Positive</b>	-	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 77	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	-
WACM 78	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Negative</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	-
WACM 79	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 80	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 81	<b>Negative</b>	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>
WACM 82	<b>Negative</b>	-	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>N</b>
WACM 83	<b>Negative</b>	-	-	<b>Positive</b>	-	<b>Y</b>

#### Voting Statement:

The first consideration is compliance (objective(d)) with the recast of the electricity directive; the limiting regulation EU838/2010; and the implications of Ofgems conclusions on P396. In this decision BSC costs are identified as '*charges for access to networks*'. Consideration was given to only modifications that consistently applied these rules and decisions Where these were not applied then the outcome could not be considered compliant or implementable.

Consideration of the range to target was also completed in relation to compliance with EU (d) the impacts on competition (a) and to a minor extent cost reflectivity(b). The objective of the EU legislation is to reduce barriers to competition between member state and ensure that there is movement towards common price ranges for network charges applicable between generators. To accomplish this it is more desirable for lower price ranges to apply equally to GB as they do more commonly in the EU. Lower target prices should also be beneficial (*or less harmful*) to competition compared to baseline relevant objective (a) and cost reflectivity relevant objective (b)

For assets that should be excluded from the calculation we considered that alignment with the finding from the CMA would be clear and reduce ongoing uncertainty. In this respect excluding Generator only spurs was the optimum option in that had the clearest legal basis and would reduce the risk of legal challenge (relevant objective (d)). In our view this option combined with a low target value and compliant inclusion of **all** charges for access to networks would have a positive impact on competition (relevant objective (a)) when compared to the current baseline. There are other options highlighted that may demonstrate enhancement respective to the baseline where combined with the full application of the compliance target price and asset exclusion criteria.

**Stage 2b – WACM Vote (If required)**

Where one or more WACMs exist, does each WACM better facilitate the Applicable CUSC Objectives than the Original Modification Proposal?

<b>Workgroup Member Paul Youngman</b>	
<b>WACM</b>	<b>Better than Original Yes/No</b>
WACM 1	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 2	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 3	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 4	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 5	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 6	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 7	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 8	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 9	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 10	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 11	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 12	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 13	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 14	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 15	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 16	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 17	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 18	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 19	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>

WACM 20	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 21	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 22	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 23	<b>YES</b>
WACM 24	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 25	<b>YES</b>
WACM 26	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 27	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 28	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 29	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 30	<b>YES</b>
WACM 31	<b>YES</b>
WACM 32	<b>YES</b>
WACM 33	<b>YES</b>
WACM 34	<b>YES</b>
WACM 35	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 36	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 37	<b>YES</b>
WACM 38	<b>YES</b>
WACM 39	<b>YES</b>
WACM 40	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 41	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 42	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 43	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 44	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 45	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 46	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 47	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>

WACM 48	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 49	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 50	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 51	<b>YES</b>
WACM 52	<b>YES</b>
WACM 53	<b>YES</b>
WACM 54	<b>YES</b>
WACM 55	<b>YES</b>
WACM 56	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 57	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 58	<b>YES</b>
WACM 59	<b>YES</b>
WACM 60	<b>YES</b>
WACM 61	<b>YES</b>
WACM 62	<b>YES</b>
WACM 63	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 64	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 65	<b>YES</b>
WACM 66	<b>YES</b>
WACM 67	<b>YES</b>
WACM 68	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 69	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 70	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 71	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 72	<b>YES</b>
WACM 73	<b>YES</b>
WACM 74	<b>YES</b>
WACM 75	<b>YES</b>
WACM 76	<b>YES</b>
WACM 77	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 78	Yes – <i>Marginally</i>
WACM 79	<b>YES</b>

WACM 80	<b>YES</b>
WACM 81	<b>YES</b>
WACM 82	<b>Yes – Marginally</b>
WACM 83	<b>Y</b>

### Stage 2c – Workgroup Vote

Which option is the best? (Baseline, Proposer solution (Original Proposal), WACM1 or WACM2)

Workgroup Member	Company	BEST Option?	Which objective(s) does the change better facilitate? (if baseline not applicable)
Paul Youngman	Drax	WACM73	(D) (a) (b)